



**NEW YORK STATE SOCIETY OF
CERTIFIED PUBLIC ACCOUNTANTS**

**REPORT OF THE NYSSCPA ESTATE PLANNING AND TRUSTS AND ESTATES
ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEES:**

**PROPOSED AMENDMENT TO SECTION 954(a)(3) OF THE NEW YORK TAX LAW
CONTAINED IN THE GOVERNOR'S FISCAL YEAR 2020 EXECUTIVE BUDGET**

March 28, 2019

Principal Drafter

Kevin Matz

NYSSCPA 2018 – 2019 Estate Planning Committee

Randy Siller, *Chair*
Marc A. Aaronson
Melissa A. Abbott
Lawrence Adler
Marlon J. Altoe
Morris Antar
Richard H. Bader
Robert S. Barnett
David M. Barral
David M. Beck
Jane E. Bernardini
David S. Bigelow
Jacques Boubli
Leonore A. Briloff
Ann Marie V. Burke
Christopher J. Byrne
Salvatore A. Candela
Maury Cartine
Carlos H. Castillo
Shao Ping Chou
Jie Chen
Shannon B. Cohen
Janis Cowhey
Steven E. D'Alesio
Tamir Dardashtian
Michael G. D'Avirro
Karen G. Deane
Scott T. Ditman
Philip P. Drudy
Philip Ebanks
Robert L. Ecker
Michelle Edry
Eric J. Engelhardt
Joseph V. Falanga
David M. First
Robert E. Flanagan
Eugene H. Fleishman
Lynn S. Formica
Laurence I. Foster
Bertram Gezelter
Melissa S. Gillespie
Rozleen M. Giwani
Jeffrey S. Gold

Melissa Gonzalez
Steven H. Goodman
Martin Greene
Ilka J. Gregory
Bharti Gupta
Robert E. Harrison
James A. Jacaruso
Mark Josephson
Frederick I. Kahn
Alan D. Kahn
Marvin H. Kalickstein
Jonathan M. Katell
Elaine Katz
Melinda J. Kaufman
Laurence Keiser
Tammy S. Kirshon
Gary M. Kollet
Eric M. Kutner
Alfred J. LaRosa
Stephen D. Lassar
Keith J. Lazarus
John E. Lee
Enze Liang
Jane F. Lilienthal
Shan Huang Lin
James P. Lynch
Kevin Matz
Herbert J. Mayer
Thomas A. McCormack
Edward Mendlowitz
Thomas F. Miele
Madelyn R. Miller
Maria D. Moderow
Mark Mohtashemi
Eugene M. Nadel
Maria F. Neary
Rita Ki-Ying Ng
Heather M. Oboda
Lawrence Palaszynski
Paul M. Pettersen
Barry C. Picker
Walter M. Primoff
Ruth F. Raftery

Kewal Ram
Anthony F. Rappa
Bernard N. Rappaport
Michael J. Reilly
Bruce Resnik
Thomas E. Riley
Stuart A. Rosenblatt
Stanley A. Ross
Mark I. Rozell
Erica F. Rubin
Barry M. Rubinstein
Michael Rudegeair
David N. Rudman
I. Jay Safier
Alan W. Saltzman
Harriet B. Salupsky
Jay G. Sanders
Darline S. Sauter
Jay A. Scheidlinger
Douglas Schnapp
Susan R. Schoenfeld
Jake Schuster
Elieen C. Semmler
Mark Shayne
Perry A. Shulman
David R. Silversmith
Edward A. Slott
Mark P. Stone
Steven W. Tartaglia
Iven R. Taub
Michael P. Toback
Dmitri Vassiliev
David P. Veniskey
Lydia Vercelli
John Voinski
Martina Weihs-Werner
Paul J. Weireter
Robert A. Westley
Shimon Wolf
Geraldine M. Wolk
Gabe M. Wolosky
Christopher D. Wright
John Zuhlke

NYSSCPA 2018 – 2019 Trust and Estate Administration Committee

Benjamin M. Lehrhoff, <i>Chair</i>	Ilka J. Gregory	Steven Parzen
Melissa A. Abbott	Charles D. Grossman	Paul M. Pettersen
Marlon J. Altoe	Mark Josephson	Ronald D. Phillips
Richard H. Bader	Anna T. Korniczky	Ita M. Rahilly
David M. Beck	Laura E. LaForgia	Anthony F. Rappa
Warren M. Bergstein	Lorilyn A. LaPolla	Terri Ruane
David S. Bigelow	Alfred J. LaRosa	Erica F. Rubin
Eric Blomberg	Merileen A. Letzter	Michael Rudegeair
Salvatore A. Candela	Jerome Levy	David N. Rudman
Jie Chen	Fazhan Li	Samia Sam
Mei-jen Chu	Steven L. Lombrowski	David Schaengold
Bruce K. Cole	Prabhjot Manchanda	Jay A. Scheidlinger
Karen G. Deane	Francis G. Marchese	Douglas Schnapp
Pamela A. Diamond	Kevin Matz	Susan R. Schoenfeld
Robert D. Dienes	Gerald L. Mayerhoff	Perry A. Shulman
Michael R. Durant	James B. McEvoy	Jonathan Shwarts
Michele Edry	Naiesha C. McNeill	David R. Silversmith
Eric J. Engelhardt	Shannon P. McNulty	Beth E. Statuto
Joseph V. Falanga	Jacob Meth	Brett Walitt
Eugene H. Fleishman	Maria D. Moderow	Martina Weihs-Werner
	Heather M. Oboda	

NYSSCPA Staff

Ernest J. Markezin

New York State Society of Certified Public Accountants

Report of the NYSSCPA Estate Planning and Trusts and Estates Administration Committees

Proposed Amendment to Section 954(a)(3) of the New York Tax Law Contained in the Governor's Fiscal Year 2020 Executive Budget

The Estate Planning and Trusts and Estates Administration Committees of the New York State Society of Certified Public Accountants reviewed and deliberated the proposed amendment to Section 954(a)(3) of the New York Tax Law (the NYTL) contained in the Governor's Fiscal Year 2020 Executive Budget (the Budget Proposal) released on January 15, 2019 and has prepared the following analysis and report.

The Budget Proposal would retroactively extend the 3-year "clawback" provisions of NYTL 954(a)(3) that applies to certain taxable gifts made by New York residents between April 1, 2014 and December 31, 2018 (the "3-year clawback"). The 3-year clawback recently expired and no longer applies to New Yorkers who previously made gifts and subsequently die after December 31, 2018.

Surprisingly, the Budget Proposal applies retroactively and includes gifts made on or after April 1, 2014 all the way through and including the date of enactment. This provision ignores the expiration date of December 31, 2018 contained in the existing law. The retroactivity of the current Budget Proposal will be deeply troubling to many New Yorkers who relied upon the well-known expiration date included since the enactment of NYTL 954(a)(3) and made taxable gifts in reliance thereon. In particular, many New Yorkers whose estates were only slightly in excess of New York's basic exclusion amount reasonably relied upon the clear language of NYTL 954(a)(3) and made taxable gifts in order to avoid the confiscatory New York State estate tax "cliff."¹ Retroactively taxing transactions that were made in good faith by New Yorkers who relied on existing law may encourage further migration by New Yorkers to other states. A fairer approach would be simply to mirror the existing provisions of NYTL 954(a)(3) and provide a

¹ The estate tax "cliff" contained in NYTL § 952(c)(1) results from the rapid phase-out of the applicable credit amount for taxable estates that are only slightly in excess of the basic exclusion amount for New York estate tax purposes. NYTL § 952(c)(1) provides an extremely steep slope that phases out the applicable credit amount for New York taxable estates that are between 100% and 105% of the basic exclusion amount, and eliminates the basic exclusion amount altogether for the estate of any decedent whose New York taxable estate exceeds 105% of the basic exclusion amount. For New Yorkers who die in 2019, the cliff has the effect of producing a *marginal New York estate tax rate in excess of 100%* for estates between \$5,740,001 and \$6,286,696. Beneficiaries of estates between \$5,740,001 and \$6,286,696 actually inherit less than \$5,740,000. The effect of the cliff is therefore confiscatory.

One possible solution to address this would be to "smooth the cliff" by "extending the runway" over which the applicable credit amount is phased out from 5% above the basic exclusion amount (as the law currently provides) to 50% above the basic exclusion amount.

corresponding statutory provision that applies to taxable gifts made on or after the date of enactment (presumably on or about April 1, 2019).

Making a taxable gift is **not** a neutral event from a tax standpoint. Giving away assets is a conscious decision that taxpayers do not make lightly, as giving away assets can have potentially adverse tax consequences to the donor and the donor's estate. Section 2058 of the Internal Revenue Code² (the IRC), per its terms, precludes a state death tax deduction for gifts of property that are not included in the federal gross estate.³ In addition, gifted property is ineligible to receive a step-up in basis for income tax purposes under IRC section 1014. Given the fact that many New Yorkers relied on Section 954(a)(3) in carefully considering their planning options, and have potentially acted to their detriment if the law is changed without warning, we believe that principles of fairness and due process warrant that the 3-year clawback be limited in its application to taxable gifts made on or after the date that the Budget Proposal is enacted into law (or at a minimum, January 15, 2019, when the Budget Proposal was released to the public).

I. DISCUSSION

NYTL 954(a) presently provides as follows:

General.--The New York gross estate of a deceased resident means his or her federal gross estate as defined in the Internal Revenue Code (whether or not a federal estate tax return is required to be filed) modified as follows:

- (1) Reduced by the value of real or tangible personal property having an actual situs outside New York State.
- (2) Increased by the amount determined under [section nine hundred fifty-seven](#) of this part (relating to limited powers of appointment created prior to September first, nineteen hundred thirty).
- (3) Increased by the amount of any taxable gift under [section 2503 of the internal revenue code](#) not otherwise included in the decedent's federal gross estate, made during the three year period ending on the decedent's date of death, but not including any gift made: (A) when the decedent was not a resident of New York state; or (B) before April first, two thousand fourteen; or (C) that is real or tangible personal property having an actual situs outside New York state at the time the gift was made. Provided, however

² All references to the "Internal Revenue Code" are to the Internal Revenue Code of 1986, as amended.

³ This tax trap could potentially be corrected if the New York Legislature were to amend [section 13-1.3](#) of the New York Estates, Powers, and Trusts Law to statutorily treat the estate tax attributable to the 3-year clawback as a debt allocable to the residuary estate that came into existence immediately prior to the decedent's death, except as may be otherwise provided in the deed of gift, will, or other governing instrument. See [Comm'r v. Estate of Bosch](#), 387 U.S. 456 (1967). The New York Tax Law could be amended to provide that such debt is not deductible for New York State estate tax purposes, so as to render it "revenue neutral" for New York.

that this paragraph shall not apply to the estate of a decedent dying on or after January first, two thousand nineteen.

The Budget Proposal would amend NYTL 954(a)(3) to change the expiration date of this statutory provision so that it instead no longer applies to decedents dying on or after January first, two thousand **twenty-six** (as opposed to on or after January 1, 2019, as this statute currently provides).⁴ The Budget Proposal further provides that this proposed amendment to NYTL 954(a)(3) “shall apply to estates of decedents dying on or after January 1, 2019.”

The application of the Budget Proposal to persons dying on after January 1, 2019 imposes an unfair burden on those New Yorkers who reasonably relied upon the clear language of NYTL 954(a)(3) which, by its terms, does not apply to gifts made by persons dying on or after January 1, 2019. We have identified the following categories of persons who would be adversely affected by the Budget Proposal. (We assume for this purpose that the date of enactment is April 1, 2019.)

- (1) persons who made taxable gifts prior to January 1, 2019 and die on or after January 1, 2019 but less than 3 years after making such taxable gifts;
- (2) persons who made taxable gifts on or after January 1, 2019 and died on or before January 15, 2019 (the date of release of the Budget Proposal); and
- (3) persons who made taxable gifts on or after January 1, 2019 but prior to April 1, 2019 and die before or after April 1, 2019 (but less than 3 years after making such taxable gifts).

Each of these categories of persons share the following common thread --- a New York resident who, in reliance upon NYTL 954(a)(3)’s well-known expiration date of December 31, 2018, has made a taxable gift with the expectation that such gift would not be included in their New York taxable estate.

We believe that the fairest approach would be to eliminate the retroactive aspects of the Budget Proposal and instead begin a separate clawback period under NYTL 954(a)(3) that would apply to taxable gifts made on or after April 1, 2019. This could be accomplished by amending NYTL 954(a)(3) to add a companion provision as a subparagraph “B” that applies to taxable gifts made on or after April 1, 2019 by decedents dying on or after January 1, 2019. As so amended, NYTL 954(a)(3) would then read as follows (with certain provisions highlighted for emphasis):

- (3)(A) Increased by the amount of any taxable gift under [section 2503 of the internal revenue code](#) not otherwise included in the decedent's federal gross estate, made during the three year period ending on the decedent's date of death, but not including any gift made: (i) when the decedent was not a resident of New York state; or (ii) before April

⁴ The Budget Proposal would also correct the spelling of the word “descendent” to instead read “decedent.” In addition, the Budget Proposal would add new NYTL 954(a)(4) and amend NYTL 955(c). We do not have any issues with any of those proposed changes.

first, two thousand fourteen; or (iii) that is real or tangible personal property having an actual situs outside New York state at the time the gift was made. Provided, however that this subparagraph shall not apply to the estate of a decedent dying on or after January first, two thousand **nineteen**.

(B) Increased by the amount of any taxable gift under [section 2503 of the internal revenue code](#) not otherwise included in the decedent's federal gross estate, made during the three year period ending on the decedent's date of death, but not including any gift made: (i) when the decedent was not a resident of New York state; or (ii) before April first, two thousand nineteen; or (iii) that is real or tangible personal property having an actual situs outside New York state at the time the gift was made. Provided, however that this subparagraph shall not apply to the estate of a decedent dying before January first, two thousand nineteen and on or after January first, two thousand **twenty-six**.

II. RECOMMENDATION

We recommend that the Budget Proposal be modified in the manner indicated above to eliminate its retroactive application so that it solely applies on a prospective basis to taxable gifts made on or after April 1, 2019.